

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE
WEST YORKSHIRE COMBINED AUTHORITY
HELD ON THURSDAY, 10 MAY 2018 AT COMMITTEE ROOM A -
WELLINGTON HOUSE, LEEDS**

Present:

Councillor Tim Swift (Vice-Chair)	Calderdale Council
Councillor Judith Blake CBE	Leeds City Council
Councillor Stewart Golton	Leeds City Council (Substitute)
Councillor Simon Cooke	Bradford Council
Councillor Imran Khan	Bradford Council (Substitute)
Roger Marsh OBE	Leeds City Region Enterprise Partnership
Councillor Shabir Pandor	Kirklees Council (Substitute)
Councillor Andrew Waller	City of York Council

In attendance:

Councillor Keith Wakefield OBE	Chair, Transport Committee
Councillor Robert Light	Chair, Overview & Scrutiny Committee
Ben Still	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Angela Taylor	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Caroline Allen	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Ruth Chaplin	West Yorkshire Combined Authority

120. Apologies for Absence

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors S Hinchcliffe, P Box, D Sheard and S Benton.

121. Chair's Comments

The Chair gave thanks to Councillors David Sheard and Nicola Turner for their contributions to the Combined Authority.

122. Declarations of Disclosable Pecuniary Interests

There were no pecuniary interests declared by Members at the meeting.

123. Exclusion of the Press and Public

There were no items on the agenda requiring the exclusion of the press and public.

124. Minutes of the Meeting of the Combined Authority held on 5 April 2018

Further to minute 108, Broadband Approvals and Spending, it was reported that City of York Council would be willing to share their experiences in respect of the rollout of the broadband programme.

Resolved: That the minutes of the meeting held on 5 April 2018 be approved and signed by the Chair.

125. Governance Arrangements

The Combined Authority considered a report of the Director of Resources on the following governance arrangements:

- To note the changes to West Yorkshire Combined Authority (the Combined Authority) members and substitute members.
- To note a vacancy on the Governance and Audit Committee.
- To approve changes to the City of York members on the Transport Committee, the Overview and Scrutiny Committee and the Land and Assets Panel.
- To endorse a proposal to appoint an Inclusive Growth Panel at the annual meeting as a formal advisory committee of the Combined Authority, and to endorse inclusive growth being embedded as a 'golden thread' across all panels.
- To consider a proposal to appoint a Place Panel at the annual meeting as a formal advisory committee of the Combined Authority.
- To endorse a proposal to appoint a substitute for each Overview and Scrutiny member at the annual meeting.

Members noted the changes to Combined Authority members and substitutes and also the proposed changes to committee membership in respect of the City of York representatives on the Transport Committee, Overview and Scrutiny Committee and the Land and Assets Panel.

Members discussed and endorsed in principle the proposed changes to governance arrangements which were set out in the submitted report. This included appointing the Inclusive Growth Panel as an additional advisory committee, to rename the Land and Assets Panel to Place Panel and extend the functions to include the Planning Portfolio Board and for each West Yorkshire and York council to nominate a substitute member for each nominated member to the Overview and Scrutiny Committee. These proposals would be brought to the annual meeting in June 2018 for approval and implementation.

Resolved:

- (i) That the resignation of Councillor Andrew Carter as a Combined Authority member and Councillor Scott Benton as his replacement with effect from 19 April 2018 be noted.
- (ii) That the termination of the appointment of Councillor Scott Benton as a substitute Combined Authority member and Councillor Andrew Carter as his replacement with effect from 26 April 2018 be noted.
- (iii) That the termination of the City of York Council's appointment of Councillor David Carr as a substitute Combined Authority member and the appointment of Councillor Ian Gillies with effect from 4 April 2018 be noted.
- (iv) That the City of York Council's revised nomination to the Transport Committee be noted and Councillor Peter Dews be co-opted onto the Committee in place of Councillor Ian Gillies with immediate effect.
- (v) That the City of York Council's revised nomination to the Overview and Scrutiny Committee be noted and Councillor Tina Funnell be co-opted onto the Committee in place of Councillor Sonja Crisp with immediate effect.
- (vi) That the City of York Council's revised nomination to the Land and Assets Panel be noted and Councillor Helen Douglas be co-opted onto the Committee in place of Councillor David Carr with immediate effect.
- (vii) That the Combined Authority notes that the resignation of Councillor Andrew Carter will leave a vacancy on the Governance and Audit Committee.
- (viii) That the Combined Authority agrees to progress the appointment of an Inclusive Growth Panel at the annual meeting, and to embed securing inclusive growth into the terms of reference of every relevant panel for the next municipal year.
- (ix) That the proposal to appoint a Place Panel for the next municipal year be progressed with the membership as set out in the submitted report.
- (x) That each West Yorkshire and York council be invited to nominate a substitute for any member nominated to the Overview and Scrutiny Committee, such substitutes to be appointed at the annual meeting.

126. Capital Spending and Project Approvals

The Combined Authority considered a report of the Director of Delivery on the progression and funding for the following schemes through the Combined Authority's assurance process:

- Clean Bus Technology Fund (CBTF)
- Canal Road Urban Village Ltd (CRUVL) (New Bolton Woods) – LEP Loan 318
- A629 Halifax Road improvement phase 5
- Beech Hill, Halifax

Details of the four schemes were provided in the submitted report and it was noted that these had been considered and recommended by the Investment Committee for approval.

In respect of the Clean Bus Technology Fund, it was noted that the project will provide £4.756 million to fund clean technology on approximately 25% of the existing bus fleet within West Yorkshire. Comment was made that any opportunities to broaden the geography of the project across the city region should be considered as this could improve the quality of the bid.

Members welcomed the presentation of the information provided in the report which had been revised following comments made at the previous meeting.

Resolved:

- (i) In respect of the Clean Bus Technology Fund (CBTF) –

That following a recommendation from the Investment Committee, the Combined Authority approves:

- (a) That the CBTF project proceeds through decision point 2 and work commences on activity 5 full business case with costs alongside preparation and commencement of the grant allocation process.
- (b) That an indicative approval to the total project value of £4.756 million (this includes the Combined Authority, Leeds City Council (LCC) grant awards and operator match funding) is given from the DEFRA Clean Bus Technology Fund awarded to the Combined Authority and Leeds City Council with full approval to spend being granted once the scheme has progressed through the assurance process to decision point 5 (full business case with finalised costs).
- (c) That Combined Authority project development and delivery expenditure of £120,000 funded by the DEFRA grant is approved in order to progress the scheme to decision point

5 full business case, before being reimbursed from the scheme's private sector match funding.

- (d) That the Combined Authority enters into an agreement with Leeds City Council (LCC) for the Combined Authority to receive and manage on LCC's behalf their CBTF funding award (£1.371 million) from the CBTF fund.
 - (e) That future approvals are made in accordance with the approval pathway and approval route outlined in the submitted report including at decision point 5 through a delegation to the Combined Authority's Managing Director following a recommendation by the Combined Authority's Programme Appraisal Team. This will be subject to the scheme remaining within the tolerances outlined in the submitted report.
- (ii) In respect of CRUVL (New Bolton Woods) – LEP Loan 318 –

That following a recommendation from the Investment Committee the Combined Authority approves:

- (a) That the LEP Loan 318 project proceeds through decision point 2 and work commences on activity 5 (full business case with finalised costs).
 - (b) That an indicative approval to the total loan value of £346,000 is given from the Growing Places Fund with full approval to spend being granted once the scheme has progressed through the assurance process to decision point 5 (full business case with finalised costs).
 - (c) That future approvals are made in accordance with the approval pathway and approval route outlined in the submitted report including at decision point 5 through a delegation to the Combined Authority's Managing Director following a recommendation by the Combined Authority's programme appraisal team. This will be subject to the scheme remaining within the tolerances outlined in the submitted report.
- (iii) In respect of A629 Halifax Road improvement, phase 5 –

That following a recommendation from the Investment Committee the Combined Authority approves:

- (a) That the WYTF (Transport Fund) A629 Halifax Road Phase 5 project proceeds through decision point 3 and work commences on activity 4 (full business case).
- (b) That an indicative approval to the total project value of

£12.09 million is given from the Transport Fund with full approval to spend being granted once the scheme has progressed through the assurance process to decision point 5 (full business case with finalised costs).

- (c) That development costs of £4.113 million are approved in order to progress the scheme to decision point 4 (full business case), taking the total project approval to £4.418 million and that an addendum to the funding agreement with Kirklees Council for the additional £4.113 million is entered into.

- (iv) In respect of Beech Hill –

That following a recommendation from the Investment Committee the Combined Authority approves:

- (a) That the Beech Hill project proceeds through decision point 4 and work commences on activity 5 (full business case with finalised costs).
- (b) That conditional approval to the total project value of £5.4 million is given (which includes a £1.4 million contribution from the Combined Authority's Growth Deal Fund with full approval to spend being granted once the scheme has progressed through the assurance process to decision point 5 (full business case with finalised costs)
- (c) That future approvals are made in accordance with the approval pathway and approval route outlined in the submitted report to include at decision point 5 through a delegation to the Combined Authority's Managing Director following a recommendation by the Combined Authority's Programme Appraisal Team. This will be subject to the scheme remaining within the tolerances outlined in the submitted report.

127. Inclusive Growth Outcomes from the Business Growth Programme

The Combined Authority considered a report of the Executive Head of Economic Services on the LEP Board's decision to adopt the revised criteria and associated conditions for awarding grants to businesses from the LEP/Combined Authority's Business Growth Programme (BGP), commencing from July 2018.

It was reported that as part of the City Region's approach to a local inclusive industrial strategy, the LEP is proposing to revise the criteria and associated conditions for awarding grants to incentivise businesses to grow in a way that delivers inclusive growth. The report provided an overview of the consultation and the main findings to date were noted.

Members discussed the importance of linking businesses with young people, ensuring a range of training is available to make the best use of the workforce and the need to monitor outcomes over a sustained period. The revised approach which was set out in Appendix 1 to the submitted report was endorsed. Members welcomed the proposal and that the proposed changes aimed to improve inclusive growth within the City Region by encouraging, incentivising and supporting businesses to pay higher wages and invest in their current and future employees.

Resolved: That the Combined Authority endorses the LEP Board's decision to adopt the revised criteria and associated conditions for awarding grants from the Business Growth Programme (BGP) as set out in Appendix 1 to the submitted report, commencing from July 2018, with a review of outputs and outcomes to be undertaken after six months.

128. Transport Strategy and Bus Strategy Update

The Combined Authority considered a report of the Interim Director of Policy and Strategy which:

- Provided an update on work to deliver the West Yorkshire Transport and Bus Strategies.
- Sought approval to adopt a Performance Management Framework of indicators and targets to set the Combined Authority's ambition for the transport system and assess performance in delivering the Transport Strategy.

The West Yorkshire Transport and Bus Strategies were adopted by the Combined Authority in August 2017. In adopting the Transport Strategy, the Combined Authority had agreed some mid-term targets for the first 10 years of the strategy and that more indicators and targets would be added.

A proposal for a full set of indicators and targets has now been developed and a copy was attached at Appendix 1 to the submitted report. It was noted that this had been considered by the Overview and Scrutiny Committee's Transport Plan Delivery Working Group prior to its endorsement by the Transport Committee. The Transport Plan Delivery Working Group will continue to have a role in overseeing the development and delivery of policies contained in the Transport and Bus Strategies.

It was proposed that the Transport Strategy be updated to include a Performance Management section to explain the indicators and targets and the process for their regular monitoring and review. A report setting out a proposed performance management framework for the Bus Strategy would be considered by the Transport Committee at its next meeting.

Resolved:

- (i) That the progress in delivering the West Yorkshire Transport Strategy 2040 and Bus Strategy 2040 be noted.

- (ii) That the Combined Authority adopts the proposals for the Performance Management indicators and targets for the West Yorkshire Transport Strategy 2040 and the Transport Strategy is updated to include a Performance Management section.

129. Corporate Planning and Performance

The Combined Authority considered a report of the Director of Resources which provided:

- An update on corporate performance including progress against corporate priorities, risk management and budget position.
- An update on progress with regard to the development of the 2018/19 Corporate Plan and the performance measures associated with this.

In respect of performance against the 2017/18 Key Performance Indicators (KPIs), it was noted that the position had not significantly changed since the previous update and a final report on performance would be provided at the next meeting.

A copy of the current Corporate Risk Register setting out the strategic risks currently affecting the organisation was attached at Appendix 2 and the current 2017/18 budget position as at March 2018 was attached at Appendix 3. The final outturn budget position for 2017/18 will be reported to the next meeting.

Resolved: That the information on corporate performance be noted.

130. General Data Protection Regulation Update

The Combined Authority considered a report of the Director of Resources which provided details on the approach developed to ensure compliance with the General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR) which will come into force on 25 May 2018.

A copy of the GDPR implementation plan was attached at Appendix 1 to the submitted report. It was noted that good progress was being made with implementing any required changes although it was likely that further work in relation to records management and further improvements to legacy systems would be required.

Resolved: That the Combined Authority notes the approach developed to ensure compliance with the General Data Protection Regulation and the progress made to date.

131. Strategy, Policy and Communications Director - Review and Approach

The Combined Authority considered a report of the Managing Director on the proposal to move to recruit to the post of Director, Strategy and Communications which is currently vacant.

Members noted the current position and, in discussing the options outlined in the submitted report, endorsed that the position be recruited to on a substantive basis. It was proposed to establish a member appointment panel to be involved in the process for the recruitment to the position of Director of Policy, Strategy and Communications.

Resolved:

- (i) That the Combined Authority endorses that the vacant Director of Policy, Strategy and Communications position be recruited to on a substantive basis.
- (ii) That the Combined Authority endorses the proposed approach to recruiting to this position and establishes a member appointment panel to be involved in the recruitment process.

132. Corporate Priorities

The Combined Authority considered a report of the Director of Resources which:

- Sought approval to enter into a borrowing facility with the European Investment Bank.
- Advised the Combined Authority of the work undertaken to establish a corporate technology strategy.
- Sought approval for the corporate technology strategy to progress through decision point 2 of the assurance framework and for work to proceed on the outline business case.

It was reported that borrowing will be required to achieve the ambition to deliver a programme of schemes over a shorter timescale than the twenty years for which Growth Deal funding has been granted. Discussions have been held with the European Investment Bank (EIB) who are able to offer a flexible facility that could be utilised alongside traditional Public Works Loan Board loans. As the s73 finance officer, the Director of Resources has the authority to enter into appropriate borrowing and investment arrangements within the agreed treasury management strategy. However the EIB needs a specific resolution from the Combined Authority to enter into a borrowing facility.

Members discussed the corporate technology strategy and executive summary which was attached at Appendix 1 to the submitted report. It was noted that the strategy set out a three year plan to update the Combined Authority's core systems to ensure compliance and robustness and provide for more efficient and effective ways of working.

Resolved:

- (i) That the Director of Resources be authorised to contract with the

European Investment Bank for a borrowing facility up to the value of £100 million and approve subsequent disbursements and amendments over the five year term.

- (ii) That the corporate technology strategy be noted.
- (iii) That the corporate technology strategy progress through decision point 2 of the assurance framework with an indicative allocation of £3.5 million, funded through the Combined Authority's internally funded capital programme.
- (iv) That funding of £150,000 be approved to develop the outline business case and that future progress through the assurance process be delegated to the Managing Director, subject to remaining within tolerance.

133. Draft Minutes of the Business, Innovation & Growth Panel held on 7 March 2018

Resolved: That the draft minutes of the Business Innovation & Growth Panel held on 7 March 2018 be noted.

134. Draft Minutes of the Transport Committee held on 16 March 2018

Resolved: That the draft minutes of the Transport Committee held on 16 March 2018 be noted.

135. Minutes of the West Yorkshire & York Investment Committee held on 21 March 2018

Resolved: That the minutes of the West Yorkshire & York Investment Committee held on 21 March 2018 be noted.

136. Draft Minutes of the Governance & Audit Committee held on 29 March 2018

Resolved: That the draft minutes of the Governance & Audit Committee held on 29 March 2018 be noted.